Studies in African Linguistics
Volume 52 Supplement 13, 2023.

Botswana as a decolonial bastion in Africa

Bert van Pinxteren
Guest Researcher, Leiden University

This paper follows the analysis of Vansina in analyzing colonization as an attempt to destroy and replace Africa's autonomous cultural systems. It shows that in Botswana, this has been only partially successful. Due to clever forms of resistance, Botswana has been able to keep part of its autonomy intact. This helps to explain the relative success the country has had. However, in the educational field, the country is now also one of the first to be confronted with the limitations that are inherent in the colonial education system. The paper argues that a gradual transition to using indigenous languages as a medium of instruction is practically possible and will become inescapable if the country wishes to reach the goals it has set for itself. In this, special attention is needed for the speakers of Khoisan languages.

1. Introduction

Ethiopia is often hailed as the only country in Africa that has never been colonized – and with some justification, especially if colonization is defined as coming under foreign occupation. However, there is more to colonization than the formal establishment of administrative authority over a foreign country. As Eldredge (2007: 12) says, 'Part of the project of colonizers was to destabilize African cultural systems, to undermine them, and to replace them.' The resistance to the establishment of foreign administrative authority was broken in Africa, often after considerable resistance and after the use of excessive violence. However, the resistance to undermining Africa's cultural systems often continued until well after the establishment of formal administrative domination and has had some success.

This paper examines this latter form of resistance specifically for Botswana. In order to do that, I will first examine the question of what a 'cultural system' is and how a project of undermining and replacing such a system can be understood. I will then use that understanding and apply it to the situation in Botswana. After that, I will examine what this means for the policy options open to Botswana for the future. I will focus on the role of (higher) education, in line with the UN Sustainable Development Goal number 4 of 'Education for All'. This paper argues that both for cultural and practical reasons, Botswana will, in future, have to make use of indigenous languages for use in formal domains, either in addition to or in fact replacing English.

2. Colonialism and culture

Over the years, the word 'culture' has come to mean so many different things that many authors nowadays prefer not to use the word at all. However, if we want to analyze colonialism as an attempt to undermine and replace a cultural system, we cannot avoid the word – but we need to define what we mean. Unfortunately, some (popular) notions of culture are not very helpful here. Thus, Miti (2015: 3), referring to Africa, has pointed out: 'A popular understanding of culture is that it refers

to the ways in which a people's ancestors lived. In other words, culture is taken to be part and parcel of a given people's past.' This means that 'culture' is restricted to offers such as those of the Bahurutshe cultural village in Botswana, where one gets to 'experience authentic Setswana culture'.[1] This is all fine and good, but how about Botswana today? Could it be that a modern Setswana culture has emerged, that is different from how things were in the past, but that is also not 'Westernized'? In other words, is there a *modern* Setswana or indeed Botswana culture that is unique to the country and in that sense, equally authentic?

In order to analyze and understand this, we need a concept of culture that is not tied to artifacts and rituals, but rather to what lies underneath: the value systems that serve as a point of reference to a people.[2] Such a value-oriented understanding of culture has several advantages. One is that it distinguishes between the individual and the societal level. This means that individuals belonging to a specific society can be very different from one another and from the societal norms; however, what they share is a common knowledge of those norms (the point of reference). Another advantage is that such a definition is non-essentialist: it is a dynamic understanding of culture, that allows for change as well as continuity. Lastly, researching value systems is possible: it has regularly been undertaken in various value surveys, such as the World Values Survey.[3]

What has the colonization process done to African cultural systems? An important analysis in this regard is the one by Vansina (1992). His analysis (p 16) is:

> By 1920, the conquest had cost the lives of perhaps half the population of East and Central Africa and had ruptured the continuity of the old traditions in the whole region by breaking their capacity for self-determination. The old social order was totally destroyed by 1920 and replaced by a new social order based on European views.

Vansina was clear about the negative effects of this destruction (p 9):

> [T]he uniqueness of Africa south of the Sahara and its difficult situation today flows from problems with its basic cultural traditions.(…) there is no longer a single cultural tradition to which all the people within each country or larger region subscribe. This means that even the basic criteria for perceiving reality are not commonly held by all (…) This situation is the fruit of a cultural history unique and specific to the region as a whole.

Vansina felt that the current situation is inherently unstable; he predicted the emergence of several 'neo-African' cultures, rooted in part in African languages.

However, could it not be that in some countries, for example in Botswana, the destruction that took place in other parts of Africa was not complete? There is some evidence of this from other parts of Africa, for example through the study of traditional governance systems. Thus, Boone (2003) has shown how and why African countries were forced in some way to take account of precolonial institutions and structures. However, the importance of this phenomenon should not be over-emphasized. Thus, MacLean (2010) has tried to compare the cultural characteristics of modern-day Akan people living on either side of the Ghana – Côte d'Ivoire border. To her surprise, she found them to be quite different. But what is it like for Botswana?

It is common knowledge that the precolonial leaders in Botswana were acutely aware of the existential threat that the Boer advance and the expansion of colonial South Africa posed to them.

---

[1] https://yourbotswana.com/2017/09/18/bahurutshe-cultural-lodge-a-glimpse-into-the-setswana-culture/ accessed 18 April 2023.

[2] The ideas in this chapter are largely inspired by my PhD dissertation, Van Pinxteren (2021).

[3] https://www.worldvaluessurvey.org/wvs.jsp

The threat of Boer domination served to unify them, to mobilize their resources, to develop their skills in warfare as well as in diplomacy – and it also drove them into the hands of the British. In order to safeguard even a limited degree of independence, they were forced to make and accept huge concessions. Thus, large and fertile stretches of land that were once part of Tswana polities are currently part of South Africa.[4] What is more, the cultural continuity that probably existed in precolonial times between the Sotho and Tswana of Botswana, Lesotho, and South Africa was probably ruptured, as already suggested by Malan (1985:33).

For Botswana, the struggle to retain some measure of cultural autonomy and the way in which culture has helped to adapt to changes can be seen most clearly in the work of Gulbrandsen (2012). In his book, Gulbrandsen contrasts the relative success of Botswana as a nation-state with the difficulties experienced by many other African nation-states and seeks to find an explanation. He feels Botswana's success should be understood as the result of the interplay between Western (global) forces and indigenous structures of power. He points to the importance of 'symbolic conceptions and hierarchies of authority rooted in indigenous polities' (p 1). In my terminology, therefore, he looks at the importance of Tswana culture, although Gulbrandsen does not use that term. In my view, the 'social', as mentioned in the title of his book should be seen as shorthand for 'symbolic conceptions', 'rooted in indigenous polities' – in my words, therefore, the book tries to explain the success of Botswana out of the interplay between worldwide developments and the autonomous reaction of Tswana culture.

In the analysis by Gulbrandsen, the key to the success of Botswana as a state lies in the fact that immediately before and after independence, traditional and modern elites came together in a 'grand coalition', based on an 'obsession with the accumulation of cattle' (p 111). It is because this coalition was in place that the state was able to deal productively with the later wealth that came from diamond mining, in contrast with the situation in other diamond-rich African countries.

However, are the Tswana the only ones in Africa that are interested in the accumulation of cattle? Of course, not – there are many cattle-based polities in Africa. In addition, Botswana is certainly not the only African country that is rich in mineral resources. What, then, makes the case of Botswana so unique? Gulbrandsen points to a unique combination of historical and geographical circumstances (as summarized above) that allowed the 'grand coalition' to form and to profit from them. Geographical and historical circumstances have created opportunities all over the continent at different points in time, but the explanation of why elites in Botswana were able to use such opportunities and others did not, must be related to a measure of continuing cultural autonomy that was broken almost everywhere else.

There is evidence of this in Gulbrandsen's analysis of the countervailing forces in Botswana. Gulbrandsen shows how the 'grand coalition' led to a great increase in wealth for elite sections of society, at the same time increasing inequalities in the country. This inequality leads to resistance, a resistance that is possibly capable of undermining the state. He gives an example related to protests against the alleged murder of a girl in order to use her body parts for ritual purposes.[5] The outrage created by this was the start of popular opposition to the continuing enrichment of the elites and their growing corruption. He explains the role played by indigenous notions of occult practices in light of the specific cosmologies of power among the Tswana and of Sotho speakers in general (p 292/308).

What makes the Botswana case specific, then, is more than the fact that people in Botswana are interested in cattle accumulation. The specificity of the Botswana case lies in its relative cultural

[4] An interesting description of what this meant for one of Botswana's groups is given in Morton (1985).

[5] The murder of Segametsi Mogomotsi in 1994.

homogeneity: in Botswana, state formation that is rooted in indigenous conceptions of authority is possible because these conceptions are known to a large majority of the people living in Botswana. Likewise, resistance to this authority can also be rooted in indigenous conceptions, for the same reason, the relative cultural homogeneity of the country. Gulbrandsen alludes to the cultural homogeneity in Botswana when he discusses the attitudes in the country towards egalitarianism. He points to the cultural unity of Botswana in this respect, in that none of the communities in the country subscribe to radical egalitarianism, 'the San-speaking peoples being an obvious exception' (p284).

One of the elements of the Tswana tradition, as Gulbrandsen points out, is the extensive use of public debate and consultation through the kgotla assemblies. Leaders in the Tswana tradition should follow the oft-quoted maxim that the Kgosi (king) is the king by virtue of the people (p 196). The colonial period has not been able to destroy the kgotla system.

Modern value survey research has enabled another way of approximating the current cultural setup of Botswana. Van Pinxteren (2021: 65) was able to use Afrobarometer survey data[6] in which the answers to culturally relevant questions were clustered together, providing an approximation of cultural proximity and difference covering 200 ethnolinguistic groups in Africa. He was able to analyze data from nine ethnolinguistic groups in Botswana in this way – they all cluster together and are clearly separate from ethnolinguistic groups in other countries.[7] In a more detailed analysis of cultural dimensions, he was also able to analyze data on 12 ethnolinguistic groups. It shows more finely grained differences; Botswana is not completely culturally homogenous. Specifically, the 'Sarwa'[8] ethnic group seems to be different, for example on the Indulgence vs Restraint dimension[9], with the Sarwa being very much on the restrained side. Together, though, this research suggests that today's Botswana enjoys a certain measure of a common and national cultural frame of reference, even though not all ethnolinguistic groups may subscribe to it fully.

In sum, Botswana society is by no means free of conflict and change. It is no paradise. However, by and large, it has been able to keep its autonomy (in the sense meant by Vansina) intact and to adapt within a changing, but commonly understood frame of reference. Because of this, it has been able to make use of the opportunities that presented themselves. In terms of explaining Botswana's success, its cultural integrity can be seen as a necessary, but not a sufficient condition for success. But how can this best be utilized in order to secure a prosperous future for the country – and what is the role of education in all of this? That will be the topic of the next section.

3. The evolution of education in Botswana

It would be far beyond the scope of this paper to attempt a full discussion of Botswana's options in areas such as how Botswana should manage its natural resources or its economy in general. However, it is possible to examine the role education can play in fostering a culturally appropriate, decolonial future for the country. Botswana's government has a slightly different focus – it aims to transform the country into a high-income economy by 2036.[10] The Vision 2036 is built on several

[6] https://www.afrobarometer.org/

[7] Karanga, Kgalagadi, Kgatla, Kwena, Mmirwa, Ngwaketse, Ngwato, Tswana and Tswapong.

[8] The 'Sarwa' ethnic designation is particularly problematic; it is used in Botswana to denote all Khoisan speaking groups; see further down for a more detailed discussion.

[9] The idea of cultural dimensions was pioneered by Hofstede; the Indulgence versus Restraint dimension is described in Hofstede, Hofstede and Minkov (2010) and on the Hofstede website: https://geerthofstede.com/culture-geert-hofstede-gert-jan-hofstede/6d-model-of-national-culture/ accessed 18 April 2023.

[10] https://vision2036.org.bw/about-botswana-vision-2036 accessed 22 February 2021.

pillars, one of them being human and social development, including education. But what should such education look like?

The first thing to consider is that education should expand. In precolonial times, schooling was done in the (extended) family and in the village or wider polity. All were able to receive training appropriate to their aptitudes and station in life. Nowadays, the family remains important, but schooling is entrusted to a large extent to the formal school system. This school system has expanded considerably since colonial times, but the basic characteristics have not changed. This concerns the content of education, which is gradually being addressed by the education authorities. However, there is another feature of colonial education that currently is usually overlooked, but which will become more and more important as education expands: this is the issue of the medium of instruction used in education.

In colonial times, education was essentially restricted to a small elite – most youth were in those times still trained using the traditional ways. This changed rapidly after independence. According to UNESCO data,[11] the Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER)[12] in primary education in 1971 was above 60% (higher for girls, lower for boys). But the system was highly selective: for secondary education, the GER was under 10%. Enrolment in tertiary education was much lower. The few students who were lucky enough to get tertiary education usually went abroad. In 1970, the 'University of Basutoland, Bechuanaland, and Swaziland' had fewer than 140 Botswana students.[13] Basically, the system was set up in such a way that many children were given a fairly basic and low-quality form of primary education; those who managed to learn in spite of the low quality of education were then selected to continue to secondary and (in a small number of cases) to tertiary education. This meant, of course, that most children did not learn much at all during their primary schooling years. However, this was not considered such a big issue, because not many resources were spent on primary education and some level of training could still be provided by the family and the community (Cloete and Maassen, 2015). Under these conditions, the choice of English as a medium of instruction was logical, given the needs of the colonial administration as well as the desire of the Botswana elites to fend for themselves in a modernizing world. At the moment, Setswana is the medium of instruction in the first few years of primary education (with English being taught as a subject); after that, English becomes the medium of instruction. A policy of introducing more languages in the first few years of primary school has been introduced and is gradually being implemented.[14]

Education in Botswana has seen a remarkable expansion over the past 50 years. Primary education is now universal. Secondary education has expanded as well, although there is a clear break between the junior and the senior level: the GER at the lower secondary level was nearly 83% in 2021, but it was just under 59% at the upper secondary level. The GER in tertiary education was nearly 25%, placing Botswana at the top in sub-Saharan Africa.[15] This expansion was achieved whilst maintaining English as the medium of instruction – the implicit assumption being that it will be possible to expand education indefinitely, keeping English as the medium of instruction. But is that assumption justified?

[11] http://data.uis.unesco.org/# accessed 19 April 2023.

[12] The GER is the total enrolment within a country 'in a specific level of education, regardless of age, expressed as a percentage of the population in the official age group corresponding to this level of education' (UNESCO 2009: 9)

[13] https://www.ub.bw/discover/history

[14] https://dailynews.gov.bw/news-detail/71393 accessed 20 August 2023.

[15] http://data.uis.unesco.org and http://sdg4-data.uis.unesco.org/

In short: the answer is no. It is fiction to think that education systems can expand indefinitely using languages as a medium of instruction that are very different from what people speak at home. This is because learning a foreign language requires time and effort, both on the part of the student and on the part of the teacher and the educational system in general. Language aptitude is not equally distributed over any population: some children learn easily, and for others, it is more difficult and requires more effort. It stands to reason that as education expands, the use of a foreign language as a medium of instruction will become more difficult. At some point, it may in fact become impossible to sustain. Chebanne and Van Pinxteren (2021: 394) have benchmarked the Botswana education system against one of the better-performing educational systems in the world, the system of Estonia (Santiago et al, 2016).[16] What they have shown is that although in Estonia, English is taught as a subject (and not used as a medium of instruction), Estonia currently manages to give more youngsters a good level of English[17] at the end of their secondary education than Botswana manages (34% versus 13%).[18] This ties in with the received wisdom in foreign language teaching, namely that teaching a foreign language as a subject can be more efficient than using it as a medium of instruction (Wen et al, 2015).

What this means is that even now, Botswana faces a problem with its university population: university education in English requires a good command of the language. But the Botswana education system only manages to give 13% of its youngsters such a command of the language, whereas it offers university education to 25%. That means that at present, nearly half the students entering university do not have a level of English that is sufficient for understanding what they are being taught. How do they cope with this? They are likely to employ a variety of strategies, but all of them are likely to detract from the effort needed to earn an academic qualification. This is also seen in another statistic published by UNESCO, the gross graduation rate from tertiary education. The last year for which this statistic was published for Botswana was 2014. In that year, the graduation rate was 7.5% - a very low rate when compared, for example, to Estonia's 45%. It means that time, money, effort, motivation, and talent all get wasted on an unnecessary scale in Botswana's tertiary education sector. It also means that in theory at least, there is ample scope for improvement: Botswana could aim to emulate some of the better educational systems in the world, for example, the Estonian system. In that case, it should be possible to more than double the percentage of youngsters that have a good command of English at the end of secondary school – although it may not be efficient to do that by using English as a medium of instruction after the first few years of primary education. Estonia uses the more efficient method of teaching English as a subject up until the end of secondary education, whilst maintaining Estonian as a medium of instruction (Wen et al, 2015). Estonian is a language with around 1.2 million native speakers – compared to over 8 million native speakers of Tswana.

However, there are limits to the strategy of continuing to improve English teaching. This can likewise be illustrated by the Estonian example. As we have seen, Estonia manages to give around 34% of its youngsters a good level of English – these youngsters are so proficient in the language that they could follow instruction at the tertiary level in English. If Botswana were able to achieve

---

[16] https://wisevoter.com/country-rankings/education-rankings-by-country/, accessed 20 August 2023, provides an education ranking, based on the Education Index that is part of the UNDP's Human Development Index. In this index, Estonia is in 18th place, where Botswana ranks 83rd.

[17] A good level of English is taken to be at least the 'B2' level of proficiency in CEFR, the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages. See https://www.coe.int/en/web/common-european-framework-reference-languages/level-descriptions for an explanation.

[18] This statistic also means that most people in Botswana may be able to hold a basic conversation in English, but are not proficient enough to follow for example parliamentary or court proceedings in the country's official language. What this means in the legal system has been shown by Matiki (2010).

the same results, its tertiary education sector would not be facing the problems it has now of students entering the system with insufficient knowledge of English. However, the GER in tertiary education in Estonia in 2017 stood at nearly 70%, compared to Botswana's 25%. This means that Estonia, even though it roundly outperforms in English teaching compared to Botswana, is unable to use English as a medium of instruction in tertiary education. Estonians are just as aware of the international importance of English as the Motswana are; yet it does not manage to give enough youngsters a high enough level of proficiency in the language so that all who are intellectually able to attend tertiary education are able to to that using English as the medium of instruction.

The conclusion, already drawn by Chebanne and Van Pinxteren (2021) is clear: if Botswana wants to develop into a high-income economy by 2036, it will have to develop all its talents, to a level at least approaching that currently reached by countries like Estonia. In order to do that, it will not be able to rely exclusively on English as the medium of instruction.

However, stating the problem is easier than finding a solution. What would such a solution look like? In order to come to grips with that, we need a brief examination of the language ecology of Botswana.

4. Botswana's indigenous language ecology

As shown for example by Chebanne (2016), Botswana is a multilingual country. Even though Tswana is spoken as L1 or L2 by a majority of the population, there are important minorities who speak different languages. These languages fall into two families, that are very different from one another. The great majority falls into the narrow Bantu family, which also includes Tswana; these are languages such as Kgalagadi, and Kalanga. A minority of speakers speak a Khoisan language. Chebanne and Van Pinxteren (2021) have argued that because the Bantu languages spoken in Botswana are all closely related Tswana could serve in formal domains such as higher education for all speakers of Bantu languages in the country.[19] However, in order to learn Tswana to a good level of proficiency, special attention would still need to be paid to the needs of L1 speakers of the related Bantu languages, because they are not all mutually intelligible. The most efficient way to do this is to start by using local languages in the whole of primary education (Walter, 2014); Tswana should be taught as a subject and introduced as a medium of instruction either towards the end of primary education or in secondary education.[20]

For speakers of Khoisan languages, Chebanne and Van Pinxteren advocate a different solution. Their difficult situation is described for example by Mokibelo (2010). These difficulties are due on the one hand to the limited speaker numbers, and on the other hand to the large internal diversity within the Khoisan language family. For speakers of Khoisan languages, solutions can only be found by seeking collaboration with Namibia and South Africa and pooling resources that way. In consultation with Khoisan community leaders, it may be necessary to set up a special institution devoted to Khoisan languages and cultures, perhaps akin to IRCAM in Morocco,[21] dedicated to the Amazigh languages and culture. In addition, there is a need to adapt schooling to take account of the pastoralist lifestyle of many speakers of Khoisan languages. Chebanne and Van Pinxteren

---

[19] In theory, any of the other Bantu languages of Botswana could also be used; given the current status of the language, its development and its wide use as a *lingua franca* in the country, Tswana seems the most logical option.

[20] In this context, Chebanne and Van Pinxteren point to the relevance of the idea that for speakers of a narrow Bantu language, learning and teaching Tswana will be easier (and therefore more efficient) than learning and teaching English.

[21] https://www.ircam.ma/fr accessed 20 April 2023.

criticize the current system of housing children in hostels to attend school in town: ‘those children who are both intelligent and strong of character – those children who potentially could be most valuable to their communities – are removed, thereby intellectually impoverishing their communities at a time when, due to climate change, increasing demands are made on their resilience and adaptability.’ (See also Pansiri, 2008; Molosiwa and Bokhutso, 2016.)

Chebanne and Van Pinxteren conclude that a transition towards Tswana as a medium of instruction in higher education will become inescapable in the future if Botswana wants to achieve its goals. Such a transition is practically possible, if well planned and managed. Special measures would be needed, though, for speakers of Khoisan languages.

By now, the reader may wonder what all of this has to do with decoloniality – it is time to return to that in the next, concluding section.

5. Botswana as a decolonial bastion in Africa

In the first part of this paper, I have argued that in spite of the damage done by colonialism and the ever-present threat of Apartheid South Africa, Botswana was able to maintain a measure of cultural autonomy and to deal with changes in ways that were at least understood in common ways, even though they were by no means uncontroversial. This has enabled Botswana to profit, first from its cattle and later from its mining industries in better ways than other African countries. As a result, Botswana now ranks top in sub-Saharan Africa in terms of offering tertiary education to its youngsters. However, this also means that Botswana is the first country that is likely to be confronted by the limitations that are inherent in the colonial system of education, dependent as it is on English as the medium of instruction.

Many authors, such as Prah (2008) have argued that culturally appropriate development and the use of indigenous languages are linked. Therefore, abandoning English (and Tswana) as the sole medium of instruction will help reinforce the cultural autonomy of Botswana’s society. However, as argued in this article, if Botswana wants to achieve its goal of becoming a high-income nation in 2036, it will also be an inescapable necessity to transition to indigenous languages: it is not a luxury. There may be those who argue against such a transition for economic reasons. Grin (2003: 54) has tried to examine this for Western contexts and feels the economic benefits are likely to far outweigh the costs. He sees the following positive effects:

- a decline in the repetition rate (children taking the same class twice because of failing grades), which entails a reduction in costs;
- a decline in the dropout rate (children leaving the system because of failing grades), which entails an increase in costs;
- better results in terms of cognitive acquisition, entailing higher productivity and ultimately a more prosperous economy and higher tax revenue.

Botswana will need to develop *all* its talents. The traditional forms of education are no longer sufficient for that – formal, school-based education has largely taken its place. But for that education to be relevant and efficient, it has to be adapted to the local circumstances. This is especially clear for the pastoralist or semi-pastoralist communities in the country, notably the Khoisan speakers. However, an education that is adapted to local circumstances and employs local languages will ultimately be to the benefit of all. The challenges confronting Botswana, for example in climate change, are not likely to diminish over time. Finding creative, appropriate solutions is going to make ‘Education for All’ more necessary than ever before.

References

Boone, Catherine (2003). *Political Topographies of the African State: Territorial Authority and Institutional Choice.* Cambridge (UK): Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511615597

Chebanne, Andy (2016). Found and Lost Languages: A Survey of the Past and Current Situation of Botswana Ethnic and Linguistic Communities. *Botswana Notes and Records (48*), 160-175. https://www.jstor.org/stable/90025334

Chebanne, Anderson and Pinxteren, Bert van (2021). Why is a gradual transition to Botswana's languages in higher education necessary? How can it be achieved? *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies (39*)4, 390-403. https://doi.org/10.2989/16073614.2021.1981766

Cloete, Nico and Maassen, Peter (2015). Roles of Universities and the African Context. In: Cloete, Nico; Maassen, Peter and Bailey, Tracy (eds): *Knowledge Production and Contradictory Functions in African Higher Education,* 1-17. Cape Town (South Africa): African Minds.

Education Indicators - Technical guidelines. UNESCO Institute for Statistics, Montreal, 2009. (Online version accessed 22 February 2017 at http://www.uis.unesco.org/Library/Documents/eiguide09-en.pdf)

Eldredge, Elizabeth (2007). *Power in Colonial Africa: conflict and discourse in Lesotho, 1870-1960.* Madison (US): University of Wisconsin Press. https://www.sahistory.org.za/sites/default/files/archive-files/elizabeth_a._eldredge_power_in_colonial_africa.pdf

Gulbrandsen, Ørnulf (2012). *The State and the Social - State Formation in Botswana and its precolonial and colonial genealogies.* New York (USA): Berghahn Books. https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt9qd0n4

Grin, François (2003). Language Planning and Economics. *Current Issues in Language Planning (4)*1, 1-66. https://doi.org/10.1080/14664200308668048

Hofstede, Geert; Hofstede, Gert-Jan and Minkov, Michael (2010). *Cultures and Organizations - Software of the Mind - 3rd edition.* New York (US): McGraw-Hill. https://e-edu.nbu.bg/pluginfile.php/900222/mod_resource/content/1/G.Hofstede_G.J.Hofstede_M.Minkov%20-%20Cultures%20and%20Organizations%20-%20Software%20of%20the%20Mind%203rd_edition%202010.pdf

MacLean, Lauren (2010). *Informal Institutions and Citizenship in Rural Africa: Risk and Reciprocity in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire.* Cambridge (UK): Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511730368

Malan, J.S. (1985). *Swazi Culture.* Pretoria (SA): Africa Institute of South Africa.

Matiki, Alfred (2010). The Case for the Use of Indigenous Languages in the Legal System in Botswana. In: *Mapping Africa in the English Speaking World: Issues in Language and Literature*, 182-190. Monaka, Kemmonye; Seda, Owen; Ellece, Sibonile; McAllister, John (Eds). Newcastle upon Tyne (UK): Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Miti, Lazarus (2015). Cultural and Linguistic Aspects of Development in Africa: the missing ingredients. *Nawa Journal of Language and Communication (9)*1, 2-24.

Mokibelo, Eureka (2010). English: a Disempowering Language for Khoe Learners in Botswana. In: *Mapping Africa in the English Speaking World: Issues in Language and Literature*, 191-203. Monaka, Kemmonye; Seda, Owen; Ellece, Sibonile; McAllister, John (Eds). Newcastle upon Tyne (UK): Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Molosiwa, Annah and Bokhutso, Keene (2016). Low educational participation of marginalised children in Botswana's rural and remote schools: Interface between cultural, structural and institutional factors. *Africa Education Review (13)*2, 48-63. https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2016.1224097

Morton, R.F. (1985). Chiefs and Ethic Unity in Two Colonial Worlds: the Bakgatla baga Kgafela of the Bechuanaland Protectorate and the Transvaal, 1872-1966. In: Asiwaju, A.I. (1985).

Partitioned Africans: ethnic relations across Africa's international boundaries, 1884-1984, 127-154. London (UK): C. Hurst & Co.

Pansiri, Nkobi (2008). Improving commitment to basic education for the minorities in Botswana: A challenge for policy and practice. *International Journal of Educational Development (28*), 446-459. http://hdl.handle.net/10311/521

Pinxteren, Bert van (2021). *Language, Education and Identity in Africa.* Amsterdam (Netherlands): LOT. https://dx.medra.org/10.48273/LOT0595

Prah, Kwesi (2008). *Anthropological Prisms - Studies on African Realities.* Cape Town (South Africa): CASAS.

Santiago, Paulo, et al. (2016). School education in Estonia. *OECD Reviews of School Resources: Estonia 2016*, Paris (France): OECD Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264251731-en

Vansina, Jan (1992). A past for the future? *Dalhousie Review (68)*1-2, 8-23.

Walter, Stephen (2014). Investigating Teacher Effects in Mother-Tongue-Based Multilingual Education Programs. In: Zsiga, Elisabeth; Boyer, One Tlale; Kramer, Ruth (eds.) *Languages in Africa - Multilingualism, Language Policy and Education*, 59-70. Georgetown (US): Georgetown University Press.

Wen, Zhisheng; Biedrón, Adriana; Skehan, Peter (2017). Foreign language aptitude theory: Yesterday, today and tomorrow. *Language Teaching (50)*1, 1-31. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444816000276

Bert van Pinxteren
Guest Researcher
Leiden University Centre for Linguistics
bert.van.pinxteren@upcmail.nl