Effects of Some Pesticides on the Growth of ARF18 and Its Pathogenicity to Heterodera alycines¹

D. G. Kim² and R. D. Riggs³

Abstract: The effects of 22 pesticides on the mycelial growth and pathogenicity of the biocontrol fungus ARF18 to Heterodera glycines were tested in vitro. The chemicals were added to agar at 10, 100, and 1,000 ppm a.i.; a block of agar containing the fungus was added to each test concentration; and fungal growth was measured. Subsequently, a block of the fungus on the pesticide-containing agar was used to determine the ability of the fungus to parasitize eggs of H. glycines. Aldicarb, bentazone, and chlorothalonil had little or no effect on fungal growth, whereas benomyl and thiophanate methyl completely inhibited growth of the fungus at 10 ppm. The relative insensitivity of ARF18 to certain pesticides would permit selected use of those pesticides with ARF18 in an integrated control program if the effects on the fungus in the field are similar to results from petri dish studies.

Key words: aldicarb, ARF18, benomyl, bentazone, biocontrol fungus, biological control, chemical pesticides, chlorothalonil, Heterodera glycines, nematophagous fungus, pesticide, soybean cyst nematode, thiophanate methyl.

During an investigation of possible biocontrol agents of Heterodera glycines Ichinohe, a sterile hyphomycete fungus designated ARF18 was isolated from eggs (Kim and Riggs, 1991). ARF18, when added to soil, significantly suppressed the number of viable H. glycines eggs on soybean roots compared to soil without the fungus (Kim and Riggs, 1995). This fungus has been isolated from cysts collected in several southern states, indicating the adaptability of ARF18 in natural soil (Kim et al., 1998).

Exploitation of this fungus as a biocontrol agent of nematodes demands that it be compatible with chemical pesticides that are applied to the soil or crops to control other pests and diseases. The effects of pesticides on nematode biocontrol fungi, such as Cylindrocarpon destructans, Verticillium chlamydosporium (Crump and Kerry, 1986), and Verticillium lecanii (Meyer et al., 1991), have been studied on agar. However, nothing is known of the effects of pesticides on ARF18. Additionally, in vitro growth studies may have more value if accompanied with pathogenicity data because growth inhibition does not always correlate with reductions in pathogenicity. Consequently, the objectives of this study were to determine how mycelial growth and pathogenicity of ARF18 to eggs of H. glycines were affected by: (i) selected chemical pesticides commonly used on sovbean, and (ii) a number of different fungicides that might be used on soybean or other crops grown in rotation with soybean.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Mycelial growth: The fungus ARF18 originally was isolated from eggs of H. glycines from greenhouse cultures at Fayetteville, Arkansas, in 1987. It was maintained on cornmeal agar (CMA, Difco, Detroit, MI) at 24 °C and was transferred to new medium approximately every 30 days.

The 22 pesticides that were tested are used on soybean or on other crops that are rotated with soybean and included 9 fungicides, 5 insecticides, 2 acaricides, 5 herbicides, and 1 nematicide (Table 1). Each of the pesticides was tested at 10, 100, and 1,000 ppm a.i., even though they would not likely occur at 1,000 ppm a.i. in soils on which soybean is grown. Molten CMA was cooled to 40 to 45 °C and the required quantity of pesticide in 1 ml of distilled sterile water was added. The resulting mixture was thoroughly agitated and quickly poured into petri plates $(60 \times 15 \text{ mm})$. After the agar had gelled, a 4-mm-square plug was cut from a

Received for publication 26 June 1997.

Approved for publication by the director of the Arkansas Agricultural Experiment Station. This research was supported in part by an Alternative Pest Control Special Grant from the USDA/CSREES and in part by a grant from the soybean growers of Arkansas through the Soybean Promotion Board.

² Department of Food Crops, Kyeongbuk Province Rural De-

velopment Administration, Daegu, Seoul, Korea 720-320.

³ Department of Plant Pathology, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR 72701.

E-mail: rdriggs@comp.uark.edu

TABLE 1. Colony growth and percentage of parasitism of *Heterodera glycines* eggs by ARF18 on agar containing pesticides.

Pesticide	Pesticide concentration (ppm)	ARF18 colony diameter ^a (mm)	Percentage of AE, SE, and J2 ^b				
			AE	SE	J2		
No pesticide, no fungus	0	n.a.	93a	1f	6e		
No pesticide, w/fungus	0	45a	3f	90ab	6e		
<u>-</u>	Fungicides						
Benomyl	10	0g	_				
Carboxin	10	12ef	25e	61d	14c		
	100	0g		_	_		
Chlorothalonil	10	4 5a	14e	82ab	4ef		
	100	43a	11f	86ab	3ef		
	1,000	41ab	21ef	73bc	6e		
Dicloran	10	24d	16ef	79bc	5ef		
	100	17e	26de	67c	8e		
E 11.1.1	1,000	9g	23ef	76bc	1f		
Formaldehyde	10 100	11f	6f ·	93a —	0f		
Mancozeb	100	0g 41ab		— 86ab	— 3ef		
WallCozeb	100	12e	33de	63cd	4ef		
	1,000	0g	55 u e		401		
Myclobutanil	1,000	11f	<u></u> 49cd	33e	18b		
Myclobutarin	100	0g	45ca		100		
Quintozene	10	27cd	24ef	72bc	5ef		
	100	12e	50cd	44de	6e		
	1,000	9g	20ef	70bc	9de		
Thiophanate methyl	10	$0\mathrm{g}$		_			
1	Insecticides						
Corbord	10	nsecuci 22de	aes 10f	82ab	8e		
Carbaryl	100	22de 0g	101	62aD	oe-		
Diazinon	100	28cd	14ef	75bc	11cd		
Biazinon	100	16ef	53c	25e	22d		
	1,000	0g					
Otassium salt of fatty acid	10	44a	27de	64c	9de		
	100	4lab	20ef	72bc	7de		
	1,000	12ef	13ef	87ab	0f		
Fenpropathrin	10	42a	69b	30e	2f		
	100	27cd	28de	66cd	6e		
	1,000	$7 \mathrm{fg}$	100a	0f	0f		
Malathion	10	44a	27de	70bc	3ef		
	100	34bc	36de	5 4d	11cd		
	1,000	$10 \mathrm{fg}$	43cd	48d	9de		
	Acaricides						
Cyhexatin	10	14e	l4ef	83ab	3ef		
	100	8fg	14ef	82ab	5ef		
	1,000	0g	_	_	_		
Dicofol	10	24d	26de	68bc	6e		
	100	11f	31de	62d	7de		
	1,000	$\theta \mathbf{g}$	_				
	Herbicides						
Bentazone	10	45a	12f	85ab	3ef		
	100	44a	11f	78bc	11cd		
	1,000	42a	4f	93a	3ef		
Glyphosate-isopropyamine	10	40ab	16ef	80b	4ef		
	100	26cd	20ef	71bc	9de		
	1,000	13ef	24ef	67c	8de		
Paraquat	10	23d	36de	62cd	3ef		
¥	100	10fg	34de	56cd	10d		
	1,000	0g		_			

Pesticide	Pesticide concentration (ppm)	ARF18 colony diameter ^a (mm)	Percentage of AE, SE, and J2 ^b					
			AE	SE	J2			
Sethoxydim	10	43a	15ef	80b	5ef			
	100	21d	20ef	75bc	5ef			
	1,000	9fg	38d	56cd	6e			
Trifluralin	10	41ab	15ef	80b	5ef			
	100	23d	27de	66cd	7de			
	1,000	0g			-			
	Nematicide							
Aldicarb	10	45a	11f	86ab	3ef			
	100	45a	17ef	83ab	0f			
	1,000	36b	42cd	58cd	0f			
C.V.	·	62.3	126.9	41.3	129.3			

^a Colony diameter was measured after culturing ARF18 on control cornmeal agar (CMA) or on pesticide-amended CMA for 15 days at 93 °C; the test was repeated once. N = 10 per treatment

pure culture of ARF18 on CMA and transferred aseptically to the center of each plate. The cultures were incubated at 23 °C in the dark for 15 days, at which time colony diameters were measured. Five replicate plates were used for each concentration of pesticide, and the experiment was repeated.

Egg parasitism: Following colony measurement, a 2- to 4-mm-diam. plug was cut from the periphery of a colony that was actively growing on pesticide-containing agar and was transferred to another petri plate containing 1.5% water agar. Five cysts, freshly collected from soybean roots, were surfacedisinfested for 10 minutes in 0.5% NaOCl, rinsed in sterile water (Kim and Riggs, 1994), and placed upon the fungus plug. Plates with fungus and cysts were stored in a plastic bag in an incubator at 23 °C for 10 days. Each concentration of pesticide was replicated three times, and the test was repeated (total of 30 cysts per concentration per pesticide). Two kinds of controls were prepared: (i) 30 cysts placed on CMA plugs with fungus but no pesticide, and (ii) 30 cysts placed on sterile water agar with no fungus and no pesticide.

After 10 days, each cyst was placed in a drop of lactoglycerol solution (lactic acid [85%]:glycerol [99.5%]:distilled water = 2:2:

1) on a glass slide (Kim and Riggs, 1994) and broken to release the eggs within. In the lactoglycerol solution symptomatic eggs became clear in about a minute, whereas the asymptomatic eggs remained unchanged for more than 5 minutes. The numbers of asymptomatic eggs, symptomatic eggs, and second-stage juveniles ([2]) in each cyst were identified and counted at ×30. The results were expressed as percentages in relation to the number of nematodes in the control cysts on water agar without pesticides. Data from growth and pathogenicity experiments were subjected to analyses with a GLM procedure (SAS Institute, Cary, NC) and the Waller mean separation test.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Two systemic fungicides, benomyl and thiophanate methyl, were the most toxic of the pesticides (Table 1). These two fungicides completely inhibited mycelial growth at 10 ppm. Benomyl was similarly reported as potentially the best inhibitor of *Cylindrocarpon destructans* (Crump and Kerry, 1986). When the effects of seven fungicides, including benomyl and chlorothalonil, were tested on the fungus *Hirsutella rhossiliensis*, a para-

days at 23 °C; the test was repeated once. N = 10 per treatment.

b Parasitism was determined by placing five cysts of H. glycines on each of three agar plugs with ARF18, followed by incubation for 10 days at 23 °C. The test was repeated for a total of 30 cysts per treatment. Uninoculated cysts had 276 asymptomatic eggs, 3 symptomatic eggs, and 17 juveniles in an average of two tests. AE = asymptomatic eggs (eggs with no apparent infection or damage); SE = symptomatic eggs (eggs infected by the fungus or damaged in some other way); J2 = second-stage juveniles that had hatched from the eggs. — indicates that parasitism was not measured because the fungus did not grow.

site of *Criconemella xenoplax*, only benomyl completely inhibited growth of hyphae and germination of conidia at 1 and 10 µg/ml (Pullen et al., 1990). Benomyl also inhibited hyphal growth and germination of conidia of *H. rhossiliensis* at rates as low as 1 µg a.i./ml (Pullen et al., 1990).

Other pesticides exhibiting toxicity were carbaryl, carboxin, formaldehyde, and myclobutanil, which completely inhibited mycelial growth of ARF18 at 100 ppm, and mancozeb, which inhibited growth at 1,000 ppm. These pesticides, along with benomyl and thiophanate methyl, probably should not be used in fields where biocontrol agents such as ARF18 have been or will be used in an integrated pest management program. Even when applied to the leaves of crop plants, pesticides can reach the soil, either directly or by washing from the leaf surfaces. For example, when benomyl was applied to peach trees, the residue measured in the soil was 0 to 0.18 µg/gram of soil (Pullen et al., 1990).

It should be noted, however, that pesticides generally are much less effective in soil than in petri plates. For example, benomyl, iprodione, and vinclozoline in agar at 1 ppm were all highly toxic to Sporidesmium sclerotivorum (Adams and Wong, 1991). However, when applied to the surface of a soil column, only benomyl at 100 ppm markedly reduced the activity of the mycoparasite, and the reduction was observed only in the top 2 cm of soil. Below this depth, the fungicide had no adverse effect on the biocontrol agent. Foliar acaricides such as dicofol, when properly applied over a welldeveloped canopy, would never infiltrate the soil unless rain or irrigation water washed the acaricide from the plant into the soil.

Cyhexatin, diazinon, dicofol, paraquat, and trifluralin were comparatively less toxic to ARF18, slowing mycelial growth at 100 ppm but not eliminating pathogenicity of ARF18 to *H. glycines* eggs (Table 1). The fungus colonized 82%, 25%, 62%, 56%, and 66% of the eggs when exposed to the respective pesticides. The effects of the above pes-

ticides on ARF18 would be minimal if there were no direct contact with the fungus upon application.

Aldicarb, bentazone, cholorothalonil, dicloran, fenpropathrin, glyphosate-isopropylamine, malathion, potassium salt of a fatty acid, quintozene, and sethoxydim allowed mycelial growth at concentrations of 1,000 ppm and could be used before, after, or in simultaneous application with the fungus. Aldicarb, bentazone, and chlorothalonil were the most innocuous to ARF18, inhibiting growth or pathogenicity very little even at the highest concentration (Table 1). Crump and Kerry (1986) also reported that aldicarb was a compatible pesticide with the nematode biocontrol agents V. chlamydosporium and C. destructans. Synergistic and(or) additive interactions between insecticides and an entomopathogenic fungus, Beauveria bassiana, have been observed (Anderson et al., 1989) for the control of Colorado potato beetle, although other data contradicted these results (Moorehouse et al., 1992). Therefore, aldicarb and ARF18 should be tested in an integrated control program to reduce initial nematode damage on crops in fields where the fungus is not established. The combined application of ARF18 and aldicarb would be particularly important in the first season of use of the biocontrol agent.

Mycelial growth was more sensitive to pesticides than was pathogenicity. Although the linear growth was greatly inhibited on plates amended with carbaryl (10 ppm), cyhexatin (10, 100 ppm), formaldehyde (10 ppm), and potassium salt of a fatty acid (1,000 ppm), the fungus still colonized as many eggs as were colonized in the control with nematodes and fungus but no pesticide (Table 1). The effect of some of the pesticides on ARF18 may be fungistatic rather than fungicidal. Similar observations were made in a test of 23 pesticides against *Verticillium* (Olmert and Kenneth, 1974).

Heterodera glycines eggs that were placed on CMA plugs hatched during the experimental period, and most plates had active J2, particularly on plates amended with carboxin (10 ppm), diazinon (10, 100 ppm),

malathion (100, 1,000 ppm), myclobutanil (10 ppm), bentazone (100 ppm), and paraquat (100 ppm) (Table 1). The I2 are more susceptible to pesticides than eggs, and eggs in plates with active J2 must be considered viable. In contrast, no I2 were observed in agar treated with aldicarb (100 and 1,000 ppm), potassium salt of a fatty acid (1,000 ppm), fenpropathrin (1,000 ppm), and formaldehyde (10 ppm); therefore, those pesticides are nematicidal or inhibit hatch of eggs of H. glycines. Other pesticides are known to affect nematode eggs. For example, the fungicide carbendazim prevented cleavage of eggs of Criconemella xenoplax at 1 mg a.i./liter (Jaffee and McInnis, 1990).

This study suggests that different pesticides have different effects on the growth and pathogenicity of the biocontrol fungus ARF18. A test in petri dishes cannot be related to what might happen under field conditions. Field studies will be needed to determine whether pesticides such as chlorothalonil, bentazone, and aldicarb, which appear to be more compatible with ARF18, could be used in an integrated pest management program for the control of H. glycines and other pests and pathogens of soybean. In contrast, benomyl, thiophanate methyl, carbaryl, carboxin, and myclobutanil strongly inhibit ARF18 and apparently could not be used in an integrated pest management program with ARF18, but these, too, may act differently under field conditions. Cyhexatin, diazinon, difocol, and paraquat are less inhibitory but not totally compatible with ARF18 and also should be tested under field conditions before being considered for an integrated pest management program with ARF18.

LITERATURE CITED

Adams, P. B., and J. A.-L. Wong. 1991. The effect of chemical pesticides on the infection of sclerotia of Schlerotinia minor by the biocontrol agent Sporidesmium sclerotivorum. Phytopathology 81:1340-1343.

Anderson, T. E., A. E. Hajek, D. W. Robert, H. K. Preisler, and J. L. Robertson. 1989. Colorado potato beetle (Coleoptera; Chrysomelidae): Effects of combinations of Beauveria bassiana with insecticides. Journal of Economic Entomology 82:83-89.

Crump, D. H., and B. R. Kerry. 1986. Effects of some agrochemicals on the growth of two nematophagous fungi, Verticillium chlamydosporium and Cylindrocarpon destructans. Nematologica 32:363-366.

Jaffee, B. A., and T. M. McInnis. 1990. Effects of carbendazim on the nematophagous fungus Hirsutella rhossiliensis and the ring nematode. Journal of Nematology 22:418-419.

Kim, D. G., and R. D. Riggs. 1991. Characteristics and efficacy of a sterile hyphomycete (ARF18), a new biocontrol agent for Heterodera glycines and other nematodes. Journal of Nematology 23:275-282.

Kim, D. G., and R. D. Riggs. 1994. Techniques for isolation and evaluation of fungal parasites of Heterodera glycines. Supplement to the Journal of Nematology 26: 592-595.

Kim, D. C., and R. D. Riggs. 1995. Efficacy of the nematophagous fungus ARF18 in alginate-clay pellet formulations against Heterodera glycines. Supplement to the Journal of Nematology 27:602-608.

Kim, D. G., R. D. Riggs and J. C. Correll. 1998. Isolation, characterization, and distribution of a biocontrol fungus from cysts of Heterodera glycines. Phytopathology 88:465-471.

Meyer, S. L. F., R. M. Sayre, and R. N. Huettel. 1991. Benomyl tolerance of ten fungi antagonistic to plantparasitic nematodes. Journal of Nematology 23:402-408.

Moorhouse, E. R., A. T. Gillespie, E. K. Sellers, and A. K. Charnley. 1992. Influence of fungicides and insecticides on the entomogenous fungus, Metarhizium anisopliae, a pathogen of the vine weevil, Otiorhynchus sulcatus. Biocontrol Science and Technology 2:49-58.

Olmert, I., and R. G. Kenneth. 1974. Sensitivity of the entomopathogenic fungi, Beauveria bassiana, Verticillium lecanii, and Verticillium sp. to fungicides and insecticides. Environmental Entomology 3:33-38.

Pullen, M. P., E. I. Zehr, and G. E. Carter, Jr. 1990. Influences of certain fungicides on parasitism of the nematode Criconemella xenoplax by the fungus Hirsutella rhossiliensis. Phytopathology 80:1142-1146.